

REMARKS/ARGUMENTS


In paragraph 3 of the Office action, claims 1, 2, 5, 10-13, 16, 21, 22, and 28 stand rejected under 35 U.S.C. § 102(b) as being anticipated by Taylor (U.S. Patent No. 4,992,933). In paragraph 2 of the Office action, the examiner states "if the claim language were to indicate that each element much [*sic* must] receive all data of the row or column, then Taylor fails to disclose that limitation." Independent claims 1, 12, and 28 have been so amended. Accordingly, it is respectfully requested that the 35 U.S.C. § 102(b) anticipation rejection based on Taylor be withdrawn.

In paragraph 2 of the Office action, claims 1, 2, 5, 10-13, 16, 21, 22, and 28 stand rejected under 35 U.S.C. § 103(a) as being unpatentable over Taylor in view of Kirsch (U.S. Pub. No. 2004/0054870). Kirsch, if it is prior art, would be prior art under Section 102(e). Applicant asserts that the subject matter of the instant application and the subject matter of the Kirsch publication were, at the time the inventions were made, under a common obligation of assignment to the same entity. Therefore, the Kirsch publication is not prior art under Section 103 and the rejection under 35 U.S.C. § 103(a) based on Taylor in view of the Kirsch publication should be withdrawn.

The objection to claims 3-4 and 14-15 is acknowledged. However, in view of the foregoing, applicant elects at this time to not rewrite those claims in independent form. Further, the allowability of claims 23-27 over the art of record is gratefully acknowledged.

Applicant has made a diligent effort to place the instant application in condition for allowance. Accordingly, a notice of allowance for claims 1-28 is respectfully requested. If the examiner is of the opinion that the instant application is in condition for disposition other than through allowance, the examiner is respectfully requested to contact applicant's attorney at the telephone number listed below.

Respectfully submitted,



Edward L. Pencoske
Reg. No. 29,688
Jones Day
One Mellon Center
500 Grant Street, Suite 3100
Pittsburgh, PA, USA, 15219
(412) 394-9531
(412) 394-7959 (Fax)
Attorneys for Applicant